Plaintiffs' Exhibit W

MALINI CHRISTINE SUCHAK

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

SIERRA BOUCHER, LILY ENGEBRECHT, NATASSIA TUHOVAK, HANNAH WHELAN, and CASSIDY WOOD,

Plaintiffs,

- against - Case No. 1:22-cv-00381-CCR

TRUSTEES OF CANISIUS COLLEGE,

Defendant.

Examination before trial of MALINI

CHRISTINE SUCHAK, taken pursuant to Subpoena, in the offices of JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC., 1120 Liberty Building, Buffalo, New York, on June 19, 2024, commencing at 2:26 p.m., before LYNNE E. DIMARCO, Notary Public.

- 14:39:44 And the third document runs from Canisius 1 | 03066. 03067 through Canisius 03068. 2
 - Q. Okay. So let's talk first about the first Document 3060 to 3062. Do you recall when you composed this document?
 - So the first page running up through or above where it says inappropriate oversight interference, that was all composed around October 3rd, 2013. I don't think it was exactly on this date, but it was within the next few days.
 - Q. Okay.
 - Everything else inappropriate oversight interference through the end of the material on page 03062 I started collecting this information in October or November, which means that I went backwards in time to compile some of the dates that were listed before that. And then everything from October, November on I wrote down contemporaneously.
 - Q. Okay. And so this document essentially covers interactions that you had with Dr. Michael Noonan from October of 2013 to July of 2014; is that correct?

14:39:51

14:40:00 4

3

7

14:39:57

14:40:12 5

14:40:15 6

14:40:20

14:40:23 - 8

14:40:26

14:40:29 10

14:40:32 11

14:40:33 12

14:40:36 13

14:40:40 14

14:40:50 15

14:40:52 16

14:40:56 17

14:41:00 18

14:41:03 19

14:41:05 20

14:41:10 21

14:41:15 22

14:41:19 23

14:41:19 A. Correct. 14:41:20 2 Okay. So why did you keep these notes regarding your interactions with Dr. Noonan? 14:41:24 3 14:41:31 4 A. The first part, the trip meeting I 14:41:35 5 documented because we had raised some concerns about the trip and I wanted some documentation of 14:41:38 6 the concerns we had raised and the response. 14:41:41 14:41:44 8 The second -- the rest of it, everything 14:41:48 after inappropriate oversight interference, I 14:41:52 10 recorded as a running record of interactions that 14:42:02 11 showed that he was behaving in an overbearing and 14:42:09 12 inappropriate way towards me. 14:42:13 13 So with regard to your notes about the Q. pre-Colorado trip meeting, I've reviewed them and I 14:42:17 14 believe that your notes express discussions that 14:42:26 15 14:42:34 16 you had with Dr. Noonan and Christy Hoffman regarding an intended trip to Colorado with 14:42:38 17 14:42:42 18 Canisius students; is that correct? 14:42:43 19 Α. Correct. 14:42:44 20 Q. Okay. You said that you raised concerns and you wanted to memorialize the response

14:42:49 21

14:42:53 22

14:42:57 23

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

talking about the concerns that you and Dr. Hoffman

in this document. And I'm wondering were you

		Malini	Christine Suchak - Ms. Nanau - 06/19/2024
			24
14:51:14	1	faculty?	
14:51:15	2	A.	Yes.
14:51:16	3	Q.	Okay. Are you a tenured professor now?
14:51:20	4	A.	Yes.
14:51:21	5	Q.	When did you receive tenure?
14:51:23	6	A.	August of 2019.
14:51:28	7	Q.	Prior to your time as an adjunct or a
14:51:34	8	faculty mem	ber at Canisius, did you spend time at
14:51:41	9	Canisius Co	llege?
14:51:43	10	A.	Yes.
14:51:44	11	Q.	And in what capacity did you do that?
14:51:47	12	A.	I was a student.
14:51:49	13	Q.	Okay. And what years did you attend?
14:51:53	14	A.	2003 to 2007.
14:51:56	15	Q.	And were you an undergraduate student?
14:51:59	16	A.	Yes.
14:52:00	17	Q.	Okay. Did you receive a degree?
14:52:02	18	A.	Yes.
14:52:02	19	Q.	What was the degree?
14:52:04	20	A.	A Bachelor of Science in biology.
14:52:10	21	Q.	Did the ABEC department exist during
14:52:13	22	your tenure	as an undergraduate student?
14:52:17	23	A.	No.

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.
1120 Liberty Building

14:52:17	1	Q. Did you study under Dr. Noonan when you
14:52:20	2	were an undergraduate student?
14:52:22	3	A. Yes.
14:52:22	4	Q. What was your experience studying under
14:52:25	5	Dr. Noonan as an undergraduate student?
14:52:29	6	A. I learned a lot from him, I still use
14:52:33	7	some of the skills that I gained from studying with
14:52:36	8	him. I also had, you know, a lot of experience
14:52:43	9	working with animals and field trips with him.
14:52:53	10	Q. Did Dr. Noonan ever subject you to any
14:52:57	11	conduct that you thought was inappropriate?
14:53:08	12	A. There was a time when I was an
14:53:12	13	undergraduate student where I was doing research
14:53:16	14	with him at Marineland and it was clear that a
14:53:21	15	trainer there had a crush on me. And he, Mike
14:53:27	16	Noonan, teased me mercilessly about that.
14:53:33	17	$oldsymbol{Q}_{oldsymbol{\cdot}}$ Did he encourage you to go out with the
14:53:37	18	trainer?
14:53:40	19	A. No.
14:53:42	20	Q. How did he tease you about it, this
14:53:45	21	crush that the trainer had on you?
14:53:48 2	22	A. Like he would say that he thought it
14:53:51 2	23	was cute or he would mention that, you know, the
	- 1	

15:08:59 1	survey actually, I asked you that question
15:09:02 2	already.
15:09:03 3	I'm going to direct your attention now to
15:09:07 4	the second document in this exhibit. I believe you
15:09:10 5	told me it went from 3063 to 3066?
15:09:17 6	A. Correct.
15:09:17 7	Q. Okay. So I have reviewed this document
15:09:27 8	and it seems to be a critique of the work that
15:09:40 9	Dr. Noonan was doing through the Canisius
15:09:46 10	Ambassadors for Conservation or the CAC program as
15:09:53 11	well as the ISHAR Institute; is that a fair summary
15:09:58 12	of this document?
15:10:00 13	MR. D'ANTONIO: Form, you may answer, if you
15:10:10 14	know.
15:10:10 15	THE WITNESS: I don't know that I would call
15:10:12 16	it a critique.
15:10:13 17	BY MS. NANAU:
15:10:14 18	Q. Okay. What would you call it?
15:10:16 19	A. I would call it an analysis of the work
15:10:19 20	being done particularly under the umbrella of the
15:10:25 21	Institute for Human Animal Relations which included
15:10:30 22	the Canisius Ambassadors for Conservation in
15:10:30 23	relation to its purported goals as stated on the
1	

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

1120 Liberty Building
Buffalo, New York 14202 - (716) 853-5600

15:10:38 1	web site which is the text that is in gray.
15:10:41 2	Q. Okay. When did you prepare this
15:10:44 3	document?
15:10:46 4	A. In May of 2017.
15:10:51 5	Q. And what was the intent behind
15:10:58 6	preparing this document?
15:10:59 7	A. These were preparation notes for
15:11:02 8	meetings that I would later have with Dr. Beth Gill
15:11:06 9	and Peg McCarthy.
15:11:14 10	Q. Okay. So Dr. Beth Gill was the dean of
15:11:21 11	the school of arts and sciences; is that correct?
15:11:25 12	A. She was the dean of the college of arts
15:11:28 13	and sciences at that time.
15:11:29 14	Q. Thank you. And what was Dr. McCarthy's
15:11:35 15	role at that time?
15:11:35 16	A. Vice president for academic affairs.
15:11:39 17	Q. And did you meet with Dr. Gill and
15:11:43 18	Dr. McCarthy about the issues memorialized in this
15:11:47 19	second memorandum, did you meet with them together
15:11:51 20	or did you meet on separate occasions with each
15:11:54 21	one, or a combination?
15:11:56 22	A. I wouldn't call this a memorandum,
15:11:59 23	these are preparation notes.

15:12:00	1	Q. Okay. Sorry.
15:12:02	2	A. And I met with Dr. Beth Gill and then
15:12:05	3	later Dr. Gill and Dr. McCarthy together.
15:12:10	4	Q. And when you met with Dr. Gill
15:12:13	5	initially, did you meet with her and anyone else?
15:12:16	6	A. Joshua Russell was there.
15:12:19	7	Q. Okay. And do you recall when that
15:12:22	8	meeting was with Dr. Gill and Dr. Russell?
15:12:25	9	A. October of 2017.
15:12:27	10	$oldsymbol{Q}_{oldsymbol{\cdot}}$ Okay. And beyond the issues raised in
15:12:34	11	this you preparation memorandum, did you raise any
15:12:40	12	other issues with Dr. Gill at that time?
15:12:47	13	A. Me, personally, not that I remember.
15:12:53	14	Q. Okay.
15:12:54	15	A. I mean, there were other Josh was
15:12:58	16	there, so he probably raised issues that aren't
15:13:01	17	listed here.
15:13:02	18	Q. Do you recall if Dr. Russell raised any
15:13:05	19	issues other than what is memorialized in your
15:13:09	20	preparation memorandum?
15:13:11	21	A. Give me a second to read what's in
15:13:14	22	here.
15:13:14	23	Q. Yeah, take your time, I'm not in a
	l	

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

1120 Liberty Building

Buffalo, New York 14202 - (716) 853-5600

41

15:13:17 1 rush.

5

6

7

A. One thing that I remember that is not in here that I believe Josh brought up was the use of fitness tests for some of the trips.

- Q. So by fitness test are we talking about physical fitness or mental fitness?
 - A. Physical fitness.
- Q. And what was Dr. Russell's objection to the fitness tests for the trips?
- A. I don't remember his precise objection to the fitness test except that they were pretty rigorous relative to the actual needed physicality of the trip.

There is legitimate reason to ensure that folks traveling into remote areas of the field especially mountainous areas can do the physical work. However, it seemed disproportionate to sometimes what they would be doing.

Like they might have to run up and down 10 flights of stairs and that some students were getting excluded from the trip because they couldn't pass the physical fitness test.

Q. Is there anything else that you recall

15:13:58

15:13:51

15:13:55

- 15:13:59 8
- 15:14:02
- 15:14:04 10
- 15:14:08 11
- 15:14:13 12
- 15:14:18 13
- 15:14:20 14
- 15:14:24 15
- 15:14:28 16
- 15:14:33 17
- 15:14:36 18
- 15:14:38 19
- 15:14:38 20
- 15:14:41 21
- 15:14:44 22
- 15:14:48 23

15:14:50	1	that	Dr.	Russell	brought	up	during	the	meeting	with
15:14:54	2	Dr.	Gill	?						

- A. Not off the top of my head.
- Q. Okay. With regard to the meeting with Dr. McCarthy, do you recall when that happened?
 - A. I think it was April of 2018.
- Q. And what were the issues that you discussed with Dr. McCarthy?
- A. It was -- I use these notes for both meetings, so it was similar issues although my recollection is with Dr. McCarthy we focused a little bit more on money going to ISHAR.
- Q. From your preparation memorandum I took it that you were questioning the legitimacy of some of the expenses that Dr. Noonan made with ISHAR money or the use of ISHAR money on certain expenses.

For example, you questioned whether a thousand dollar plus cameras had to be purchased every year, correct?

- A. Yes.
- $oldsymbol{Q}_{oldsymbol{\cdot}}$ And that he used students as pack mules to haul video and photo equipment often at the

15:15:13 7

15:14:57

15:15:00

15:15:08

15:15:10

3

5

6

- 15:15:15 8
- 15:15:18
- 15:15:21 10
- 15:15:24 11
- 15:15:28 12
- 15:15:32 13
- 15:15:40 14
- 15:15:44 15
- 15:15:50 16
- 15:15:55 17
- 15:15:55 18
- 15:16:04 19
- 15:16:06 20
- 15:16:07 21
- 15:16:08 22
- 15:16:12 23

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

1120 Liberty Building Buffalo, New York 14202 - (716) 853-5600 42

43

15:16:16 1 expense of being able to bring on their own 15:16:19 2 luggage?

- A. Yes.
- Q. And that he treated these trips more as an extension of his personal hobbies rather than actually doing research?
- A. That was my opinion at the time was that he was pursuing a hobby. However, my understanding of scholarship has evolved over time and I now believe that he and the university both believed that this was a scholarly endeavor.
- Q. Do you believe that it was a scholarly endeavor, I think you referred to these trips as echo tourism and not real research trips in this memorandum, correct?
- A. The field experience itself does not align with the principals of field research, which would involve a set of methods that you would use, for example, to evaluate habitat or presence of certain animals or something like that.

So in that sense it is not the same thing as field research and that is why I would call it echo tourism.

15:16:35 7

15:16:20

15:16:21

15:16:26

15:16:30

3

5

6

- 15:16:38 8
- 15:16:42
- 15:16:46 10
- 15:16:52 11
- 15:16:54 12
- 15:16:54 13
- 15:16:59 14
- 15:17:02 15
- 15:17:04 16
- 15:17:08 17
- 15:17:12 18
- 15:17:15 19
- 15:17:18 20
- 15:17:20 21
- 15:17:25 22
- 15:17:25 23

it would be a legitimate form of scholarship, I 15:23:26 have questions about the quality of that work. 15:23:29

BY MS. NANAU:

- Q. Thank you. I appreciate that clarification.
 - Yeah.
- Did you articulate that to Dr. McCarthy Q. and Dr. Gill when you met with them in 2017 and 2018?
- Those two meetings have blended together. I have articulated my concerns about the quality or experience in one or both of those meetings. I don't know for sure it was both. was using the same notes and it blended together.
- Did you take any handwritten notes or Q. did you type any written notes up after either meeting with Dr. Gill or Dr. McCarthy?
 - Α. Not to my knowledge.
- Q. What was the follow-up of these meetings with Dr. Gill and Dr. McCarthy?
 - A. I don't know.
 - So you didn't meet with them again? Q.
 - A. No.

5

15:23:34 6

15:23:31

15:23:31

15:23:33

3

7

8

15:23:34

15:23:39

15:23:46 9

15:23:46 10

15:23:49 11

15:23:53 12

15:23:56 13

15:23:59 14

15:24:01 15

15:24:05 16

15:24:08 17

15:24:11 18

15:24:13 19

15:24:15 20

15:24:18 21

15:24:21 22

15:24:24 23

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

1120 Liberty Building Buffalo, New York 14202 - (716) 853-5600 49

15:24:27	1	Q. How did Dr. McCarthy react to your
15:24:33	2	presentation in the April 2018 meeting?
15:24:38	3	A. I didn't give a presentation, it was
15:24:40	4	just a discussion.
15:24:41	5	Q. Okay. How did she react to the
15:24:44	6	information that you were providing to her about
15:24:47	7	these trips that Dr. Noonan was taking with the
15:24:50	8	students?
15:24:53	9	A. I don't remember any specific response
15:24:56	10	from her except perhaps general concern about the
15:25:00	11	points we were bringing up.
15:25:03	12	Q. What does general concern mean?
15:25:06	13	A. I feel like I have a vague memory that
15:25:09	14	to mean she said, oh, that's concerning basically.
15:25:15	15	I don't have any specific memory of the back and
15:25:18	16	forth with her.
15:25:19	17	Q. Okay. And with Dr. Gill, what was her
15:25:23	18	reaction to the concerns that you and Dr. Russell
15:25:25	19	raised about the use of resources and the quality
15:25:30	20	of the educational experience on these trips with
15:25:34	21	Dr. Noonan and the students?
15:25:35	22	A. I believe it was much the same.
15:25:43	23	Q. So now I'm turning to the third
	- 1	

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

1120 Liberty Building
Buffalo, New York 14202 - (716) 853-5600

73

	ļ	
15:51:27	1	primates?
15:51:27	2	A. Yes, I did know that.
15:51:39	3	Q. With regard to this exhibit,
15:51:47	4	Plaintiff's 30, the last bullet point is no
15:51:52	5	follow-up that she was aware of. Do you know what
15:51:55	6	that is regarding?
15:51:56	7	A. So I believe I probably told Linda that
15:52:00	8	there was no follow-up that I, the she is me in
15:52:03	9	this case, was aware of from Beth Gill.
15:52:06	10	Q. Okay. Did you also tell
15:52:09	11	Ms. Walleshauser that you had a meeting in 2018
15:52:12	12	with Dr. McCarthy regarding similar issues that you
15:52:15	13	raised with Dr. Gill?
15:52:16	14	A. I don't remember whether I told her
15:52:18	15	that or not.
15:52:19	16	MS. NANAU: Okay. So I'm going to show you
15:52:39	17	what's marked as Plaintiff's 31.
15:52:39	18	The following was marked for Identification:
	19	PLAINTIFF EXH. 31 Bates stamped Canisius 424
	20	to 442
15:52:42	21	BY MS. NANAU:
15:52:43	22	Q. Plaintiff's 31 is document with the
15:52:47	23	Bates stamp range Canisius 424 to 442. I'm going

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

1120 Liberty Building

Buffalo, New York 14202 - (716) 853-5600

74

1	to direct your attention to page Canisius 431.
2	So at the bottom of 431 there is a heading
3	that says Dr. Malini Suchak statement 2/26/2019 and
4	I believe your first name is misspelled?
5	A. Correct.
6	Q. I would like you to read the statement,
7	it goes to the next page, and then I'm going to ask
8	you a couple questions.
9	A. As a former student of Dr. Noonan's
10	MR. D'ANTONIO: She wants you to read it to
11	yourself.
12	MS. NANAU: I mean, you can read it out loud
13	if you want.
14	MR. D'ANTONIO: Otherwise she has to take it
15	down.
16	THE WITNESS: Yeah, I thought that was
17	weird. I'm reading from here.
18	BY MS. NANAU:
19	Q. Dr. Mil ani Suchak's statement, yes.
20	A. Okay. I'm done.
21	Q. Okay. So my question is, did you
22	prepare the body of this statement and provide it
23	to someone at Canisius, or is this something else?
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

1120 Liberty Building
Buffalo, New York 14202 - (716) 853-5600

75

- Okay. So this is not your statement as

 15:55:00 3 you prepared it, correct?
 - :55:02 4 **A.** Correct.
 - The date 2/26/2019, does that refresh your recollection as to when you may have met with Ms. Walleshauser or someone else regarding

 Dr. Noonan?
 - A. Yes, I met with Linda Walleshauser that day.
 - Q. Does the information under the heading Dr. Malini Suchak's statement 2/26/2019, does it fairly summarize the information that you provided to you Dr. -- I mean to Ms. Walleshauser on February 26th, 2019?
 - $oldsymbol{\lambda}$. I believe this is a good summary of what I reported.
 - Q. Okay. One of the things that is reported in this statement that you and I haven't discussed is Dr. Noonan hugging you and encouraging group hugs all the time?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. Can you tell me about that, when did

15:55:02 15:55:03 5 15:55:08 15:55:11 15:55:14 8 15:55:14 15:55:18 10 15:55:18 11 15:55:21 12 15:55:25 13 15:55:28 14 15:55:34 15 15:55:36 16 15:55:39 17 15:55:39 18 15:55:45 19 15:55:49 20 15:55:58 21 15:56:00 22 15:56:01 23

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.
1120 Liberty Building
Buffalo, New York 14202 - (716) 853-5600

15:56:04 that start that Dr. Noonan would try to hug you or 15:56:09

- A. So he would try to hug me, that started when I became a full-time faculty member in 2013. Encouraging group hugs, I don't know when that started, but that was something that he would do kind of in celebration or, you know, after an event or something and that was going on when I started in 2013.
- It looks like in 2015 there was Q. Okay. a staff student event and Dr. Noonan came up behind you, shoved you from behind and tried to make you participate in a group hug; is that correct?
 - Α. Yes.
 - And you got very upset? Q.
 - Α. Yes.
- And then in response my understanding Q. from this is that Dr. Paul Waldau told Dr. Noonan that the hugging was inappropriate and needed to stop, correct?
 - Α. Yes.
- Did the hugging stop after Dr. Waldau Q. approached Dr. Noonan about the hugging and how it

encourage group hugs?

15:57:21 22

3

5

6

7

9

15:56:11

15:56:17

15:56:22

15:56:26

15:56:31

15:56:36

15:56:41

15:56:42 10

15:56:48 11

15:56:53 12

15:56:59 13

15:57:01 14

15:57:02 15

15:57:05 16

15:57:06 17

15:57:10 18

15:57:17 19

15:57:20 20

15:57:20 21

15:57:25 23

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.

77

15:57:28 had to stop after the 2015 event? 15:57:30 A. Yes. 3 15:57:31 Q. Did Dr. Noonan ever object to your 15:57:34 4 objections to his hugging? 15:57:38 5 A. He didn't -- no, he didn't object to 15:57:43 6 it. 7 15:57:43 Q. Okay. So he didn't say anything like everyone likes a hug or students like hugs or I 15:57:46 8 like to hug, so nothing like that? 15:57:49 15:57:51 10 A. No. Okay. It's also reported here that in 15:57:52 11 future interactions or meetings with you, 15:58:01 12 Dr. Noonan would tease you and gesture to you that 15:58:05 13 he was going to hug you which made you very 15:58:08 14 15:58:12 15 uncomfortable? 15:58:13 16 A. Yes. 15:58:13 17 How long did the gesturing of hugging Q. 15:58:16 18 go on for? 15:58:20 19 I would say it wasn't long after that Α. that it stopped completely. Like maybe -- I mean, 15:58:25 20 this was in like April or May of 2015 so then we 15:58:30 21 went on summer. And my recollection is by like 15:58:34 22 15:58:38 23 2016 it had fully stopped.

JACK W. HUNT & ASSOCIATES, INC.
1120 Liberty Building
Buffalo, New York 14202 - (716) 853-5600

15:58:40	1	Q. Okay. Did you ever report to anyone in
15:58:44	2	Canisius's administration either during your
15:58:48	3	meeting with Dr. Gill in 2017, your meeting with
15:58:53	4	Dr. McCarthy in 2018, or at any other time that
15:58:58	5	Dr. Noonan subjected you to these hugs that you
15:58:58	6	objected to?
15:59:01	7	A. No.
15:59:02	8	Q. Is there any reason why not?
15:59:04	9	A. When I started in 2013 and it started
15:59:07	10	happening, I reviewed the policies and at the time
15:59:12	11	I really could only find a sexual harassment
15:59:17	12	policy, not a general harassment policy.
15:59:18	13	And it was very clear to me that it was not
15:59:22	14	sexual in nature and did not fall under that policy
15:59:25	15	so I didn't feel that he was violating any policy
15:59:30	16	that I could find.
15:59:30	17	Q. Why was it clear to you that it was not
15:59:34	18	a violation of the sexual harassment policy?
15:59:36	19	A. Because it was never when we were
15:59:39	20	alone, it was only in front of other people. It
15:59:43	21	was a power move. I pushed back against him and it
15:59:47	22	was a way that he was able to assert power over me.
	ا ہہ	

15:59:52 23

And so I felt that based -- like I read the